

Report from the 2013 Committee of Visitors



Department of Energy
Office of Science
Washington, DC 20585

Office of the Director

July 23, 2012

Dr. Donald Geesaman
Chair
DOE/NSF Nuclear Science Advisory Committee
Argonne National Laboratory
9700 South Cass Avenue
Argonne, IL 60439

Dear Dr. Geesaman:

This letter requests that the Nuclear Science Advisory Committee (NSAC) assemble a Committee of Visitors (COV) to review the management processes of the Department of Energy (DOE) Office of Science's Office of Nuclear Physics program. The panel should provide an assessment of the processes used to solicit, review, recommend, and document proposal actions and monitor active projects and programs for both the DOE laboratory and university programs.

The panel should assess the operations of the Office's programs during the fiscal years 2010, 2011, and 2012. The panel may examine any files from this period for all actions administered by the program for the period under review, including funding at national laboratories, universities, and other activities handled by the program. The panel should consider and provide evaluation of the following major elements:

- (a) the efficacy and quality of the processes used to solicit, review, recommend, monitor, and document application, proposal, and award actions; and
- (b) the quality of the resulting portfolio, including its breadth and depth, and its national and international standing.

In addition to these findings, comments on observed strengths or deficiencies in any component or sub-component of the Office's portfolio and suggestions for improvement would be very valuable. The panel should also comment upon what progress has been made towards addressing action items from the previous COV review. You should work with the Associate Director of Science for Nuclear Physics to establish the processes and procedures so as to enable the first COV meeting to take place before the end of January 2013. The results of this assessment should be documented in a report with findings, comments, and recommendations clearly articulated; the report should be submitted to NSAC by March 15, 2013.

We appreciate the Committee's willingness to take on these important activities, and we look forward to your final report concerning these important tasks.

Sincerely,

W. F. Brinkman
Director, Office of Science

cc:
Edward Seidel, NSF
Bradley Keister, NSF

2013 Committee of Visitors Membership

Joseph Arango	JLAB Site Office
Kelly Beierschmitt	ORNL
Elizabeth Beise	Maryland
Jeffery Blackmon	LSU
David Dean	ORNL
Latifa Elouadrhiri	JLab
Olga Evdokimov	Illinois-Chicago
Paul Fallon	LBNL
Alexandra Gade	MSU
Susan Gardner	Kentucky
Donald Geesaman	ANL
John Harris, Chair	Yale
Stuart Henderson	FNAL
Kate Jones	Tennessee
Joshua Klein	Pennsylvania
Reiner Kruecken	TRIUMF
Berndt Mueller	Duke-BNL
Michael Pennington	JLAB
Aundra Richards	LBNL Site Office
Lee Roberts	Boston
Thomas Roser	BNL
Susan Seestrom	LANL

Major Items of Review

The COV will present findings, comments and recommendations on the following items in the visit and review of the ONP of the DOE on 7 – 9 January 2013:

- The effectiveness, efficiency and quality of the processes used to solicit, review, recommend, and document proposal actions.
- The monitoring of active projects and programs.
- Effect of the award process on the breadth and depth of the Nuclear Physics portfolio elements.
- The national and international standing of the portfolio elements.
- Progress made towards addressing action items from the previous COV review.
- Suggestions regarding the COV process.

Agenda of COV at ONP-DOE – Day 1

Monday, January 7

8:00 am Meet at DOE

8:15 am Executive session: COV charge, etc..., procedures

8:50 am Welcome – T. Hallman

9:00 am Office of Nuclear Physics Overview – T. Hallman

9:40 am Physics Research Division Overview – T. Hallman

10:10 am Facilities & Project Management Division Overview – J. Gillo

10:40 am Break

11:00 am Program Managers Presentations - Research Division: Sowinski (HI),
Barnes (ME), Baktash (LE), Fai (TH), Barnes (SciDac/NucData)

12:40 pm Working Lunch

1:40 pm Program Managers Presentations: Facilities & Project Management Div:
Gillo (Facilities), Farkhondeh (Accelerator R&D),
Marsiske (Instrumentation), Hawkins (Major Initiatives)

3:00 pm Isotope Program Overview – J. Gillo

3:30 pm Budget Process - J. Wolfe

3:50 pm Information Tracking (PAMS) – L. Blevins

4:10 pm Discussion with Hallman and Division Directors

4:50 pm Break

5:00 pm Committee Breakouts (Program Managers available for discussion with
breakout groups as requested): Grants 1, Grants 2, Lab Res., Facility Ops,
Projects, Isotopes

6:15 pm Executive session – Committee generates list of additional information
desired for presentation on Wednesday.

7:30 pm Adjourn

Agenda of COV at ONP-DOE – Days 2 &3

Tuesday, January 8

- 8:00 am Meet at DOE
- 8:15 am Executive session
- 9:30 am Committee Breakouts (PMs available for breakout groups on request):
Grants 1, Grants 2, Lab Res., Facility Ops, Projects, Isotopes
- 10:30 am Break
- 10:45 am Committee Breakouts (PMs available for breakout groups on request)
- 12:30 pm Working Lunch
- 1:15 pm Committee Breakouts (PMs available for breakout groups on request)
- 2:30 pm Executive session: Discuss initial findings
- 4:30 pm Committee work or Meet with Program Managers, assign homework
- 6:30 pm Adjourn
- 7:30 pm Dinner

Wednesday, January 9

- 8:00 am Meet at DOE
- 8:30 am Report on Homework
- 9:30 am Executive session: Preparation of report
- 12:00 pm Executive Working Lunch
- 1:00 pm Executive session: Preparation of report
- 3:00 pm Meet with the Associate Director and Division Directors
- 3:30 pm Closeout
- 4:00 pm Adjourn

Plans for Delivery of Report to NSAC

Draft Report is being discussed and edited by the COV.

Report to be delivered to NSAC Chair by 22 February 2013.

Report to be presented at NSAC Meeting, 8 – 9 March 2013.